

MEETING MINUTES

Jackson Historic District Commission

Zoom Call- Meeting ID: 912 9192 3269

Monday, May 17th, 2021 at 6:00 PM

MEMBERS PRESENT: Tony Raykovich, Thaddaus Williams, Mary Lee Clark, Scott Slagor, Maurice Imhoff, Russ Desy

MEMBERS ABSENT: None

1. Call to Order

Chairman Raykovich called the meeting to order at 6:00 pm

2. Public Comment –None.

3. Adoption of Agenda

Commissioner Slagor moved to approve the agenda as presented. The motion was supported by Commissioner Imhoff.

The motion passed unanimously on a voice vote.

4. Approval of the April 19, 2021 Meeting Minutes

Commissioner Slagor moved, with support from Commissioner Williams, to approve the minutes as presented.

The motion passed unanimously on a voice vote.

5. Applications for Review

A. 210 Second St

Applicant not in attendance. Commissioners discussed that they would like to table the request to the next meeting to be able to discuss the request and property with the applicant.

Commissioner Desy moved, with support from Commissioner Imhoff, to table the request to the next meeting.

The motion passed 6-0 on a roll call vote

(Desy-Y, Imhoff-Y, Slagor-Y, Clark-Y, Williams-Y, Raykovich-Y)

B. 1300 W. Franklin St

Staff presented the request of the applicant to replace the original wood windows at the home with proposed double-hung, vinyl Wallside Windows. The applicant and contractor were in

attendance and stated that they planned to maintain the windows with unique architectural design and French doors at the first floor.

Owners of the home, Mr. and Mrs. Damich were in attendance.

Commissioner Slagor asked the applicants what necessitated the request to replace the windows. Mr. and Mrs. Damich stated that the windows were no longer opening or were very difficult to open due to multiple layers of paint, that the wood windows were not ideal with children as they may get splinters, and that the windows were not as energy efficient as they would like.

Commissioner Slagor stated that he empathized with the applicants as he too lives in an old home with wood windows and he too has had to scrape paint and maintain his windows. Mr. Slagor added that many studies show that a good storm windows can provide better energy efficiency than vinyl windows. He added that he understood the maintenance can be daunting, but he also added that the existing windows were over 100 years old and with some maintenance could still be functional. He added that the windows were likely made from old growth lumber and once removed, would not be replaceable.

Commissioner Desy commented about the size of the windows. He stated that often times that window companies do not replace the full size of the windows and the resulting glass area in the window is less than the original. Mr. Damich asked what the glass area had to do with the historic character of the home. Mr. Slagor stated that historic homes were not historic because they *looked* historic, but that they were historic because they were historic. He added that original windows are a distinguishing feature on a home and if removed, especially if the window area were changed, that the removal would alter the historic character of the home. Mr. Slagor reference the NPS Standards for Rehab that the Commission must adhere to in reviewing applications. Commissioner Slagor explained that when you leave the sash and remove the jamb, you will lose glass area when replacing windows.

Mr. Damich stated that in his conversations with the Wallside Windows rep, that the windows would look exactly the same from the outside, but would be a different material.

Bill Eldred, rep from Wallside Windows, joined the meeting at 6:40pm.

Commissioner Williams asked Mr. and Mrs. Damich if the biggest issue was that the windows would not open? Mrs. Damich stated that a few of the windows had cracks. She added that replacing the windows with wood windows was simply not in the budget.

Commissioner Slagor added that in most historic districts, windows are typically only replaced if they are beyond repair. The first step is always to repair, and if they are beyond repair, then replacements can be considered. Mr. Slagor stated that to consider the proposal, he would need information from the contractor stating that the windows were beyond repair and to evaluate the costs and replacement method. Commissioner Desy agreed.

Commissioner Slagor moved, with support from Commissioner Imhoff, to deny the application for work at 1300 W. Franklin St, noting that the proposed vinyl windows would alter the historic character of the building. Commissioners cited Secretary of Interior Standards for Rehab standards #2 #5, and #6.

**The motion passed 6-0 on a roll call vote.
(Slagor-Y, Imhoff-Y, Williams-Y, Clark-Y, Desy-Y, Raykovich-Y)**

C. 743 W. Franklin

Staff presented the request of the applicant, Mr. Spencer Boehm, to install a black metal roof on the home and garage. The existing home had a black asphalt shingle roof. Staff explained that per Chapter 13 of the ordinance, 1-for-1 roof replacements do not require HDC review, however the change of material from asphalt shingles to metal roof did require review of the Commission.

Commissioner Desy asked Mr. Boehm if he knew the original roofing material. He stated that he did not know, but that there were a few layers of asphalt shingles. He added that the insurance company recommended replacing the roof. Mr. Boehm added that he and his contractor had been in communications with a City Building Inspector who told them that metal roofing could be permitted. He talked about the cost of material, financial constraints, and having to also re-roof the garage even though it did not need to be replaced at this time. He added that the roof is not readily visible from the street due to the proximity of other homes and the pitch of the roof.

Commissioner Slagor stated that many Commissioners view metal roofs differently, noting that some prefer asphalt shingles because they have a similar appearance to cedar shake and some approve of metal as it has been used as a roofing material throughout history. He added that the proposed black color would not be as noticeable as a blue or red barn-style color.

Commissioner Clark agreed that the closeness of homes and pitch of roof made it so that the roof was not particularly visible and she agreed that the proposed black metal roof could be appropriate on the home.

Commissioner Desy stated that he did not believe that the metal would complement the other homes on the block, but also noted that the roof was not highly visible. He also added that it appeared other significant changes had occurred at the home over the years.

Commissioner Clark moved, with support from Commissioner Williams, to approve the application to install a black metal roof at 743 W. Franklin St citing the density of the neighborhood, roof form (side gable and not front gable), and the character of the home, also noting that the roof being replaced did not appear to be original. Commissioners cited SOI Standard #9 in approving the request.

**The motion to approve passed 6-0 on a roll call vote
(Clark-Y, Imhoff-Y, Williams-Y, Desy-Y, Slagor-Y, Raykovich-Y)**

6. Study Items

7. New Business

A. Housing Inspector Q&A

Staff introduced City Housing Inspector O'Connor. The Commission and Mr. O'Connor discussed common issues at historic properties, issues commonly observed at the exterior of home during the inspection process, and how improve the process of connecting homeowners with the HDC.

B. Informational Worksheet- Roofing

Commissioner Imhoff moved, with support from Commissioner Clark, to table the worksheet to the following meeting.

The motion passed unanimously on a voice vote

8. Final Comments

A. Public Comment

B. Commissioner Comment-

Commissioner Clark asked when the Commission might be meeting in person. Staff stated that there hadn't yet been any policy announced in light of the new CDC guidelines.

9. Reminder: Next Regular Meeting

Chairman Raykovich reminded the Commission that the next scheduled meeting will be Monday, June 21, 2021 at 6:00 pm.

10. Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 7:56pm.

Respectfully submitted,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Adam East". The signature is written in a cursive, flowing style.

Adam East
Senior Planner